

IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT
FOR THE NORTHERN DISTRICT OF CALIFORNIA

SCOTT EMERSON FELIX,
Petitioner,

No. C 10-1624 WHA (PR)

ORDER OF DISMISSAL

vs.

S. MAYBERG, Director,
Respondent.

This is a habeas case filed pro se by an inmate in San Luis Obispo County Jail. Petitioner alleges that jail officials have not allowed him sufficient access to his legal papers, office supplies and other materials that he needs to pursue cases in the state court.

"Federal law opens two main avenues to relief on complaints related to imprisonment: a petition for habeas corpus, 28 U.S.C. § 2254, and a complaint under the Civil Rights Act of 1871, Rev. Stat. § 1979, as amended, 42 U.S.C. § 1983. Challenges to the lawfulness of confinement or to particulars affecting its duration are the province of habeas corpus." *Muhammad v. Close*, 540 U.S. 749, 750 (2004). Petitioner's claims involve the conditions of his confinement and not the fact or duration of his confinement. As such, they are not the proper subject of a habeas action. *See Moran v. Sondalle*, 218 F.3d 647, 650-52 (7th Cir. 2000); *Badea v. Cox*, 931 F.2d 573, 574 (9th Cir. 1991) (civil rights action is proper method of challenging conditions of confinement); *Crawford v. Bell*, 599 F.2d 890, 891-92 & n.1 (9th Cir. 1979) (affirming dismissal of habeas petition on basis that challenges to terms and conditions of confinement must be brought in civil rights complaint).


1 In an appropriate case a habeas petition may be construed as a Section 1983 complaint.
2 *Wilwording v. Swenson*, 404 U.S. 249, 251 (1971). Although the court *may* construe a habeas
3 petition as a civil rights action, it is not *required* to do so. Since the time when the *Wilwording*
4 case was decided there have been significant changes in the law. For instance, the filing fee for
5 a habeas petition is five dollars, and if leave to proceed in forma pauperis is granted, the fee is
6 forgiven. For civil rights cases, however, the fee is now \$350 and under the Prisoner Litigation
7 Reform Act the prisoner is required to pay it, even if granted in forma pauperis status, by way
8 of deductions from income to the prisoner's trust account. *See* 28 U.S.C. 1915(b)(1). A
9 prisoner who might be willing to file a habeas petition for which he or she would not have to
10 pay a filing fee might feel otherwise about a civil rights complaint for which the \$350 fee would
11 be deducted from income to his or her prisoner account. Also, a civil rights complaint which is
12 dismissed as malicious, frivolous, or for failure to state a claim would count as a "strike" under
13 28 U.S.C. § 1915(g), which is not true for habeas cases.

14 In view of these potential pitfalls for petitioner if the petition were construed as a civil
15 rights complaint, the case is **DISMISSED** without prejudice to petitioner filing a civil rights
16 action if he wishes to do so in light of the above. If petitioner decides to pursue his claims in
17 civil rights action, he must file it in the Central District of California, which is the proper venue
18 for claims arising out of San Luis Obispo County. *See* 28 U.S.C. 84.

19 The clerk shall close the file.

20 **IT IS SO ORDERED.**

21
22 Dated: June 14, 2010.



WILLIAM ALSUP
UNITED STATES DISTRICT JUDGE